

Appendix 3

ROBERT A. MOORE PTY LTD
Architects and Conservation Consultants

25 Cobar Street, Willoughby, NSW 2068, Australia
Tel : 61 2 9958 7755

Email : robertamoore@ozemail.com.au

Incorporated in New South Wales - ACN 003 546 423
Nominated architect Robert Allan Moore Reg. No. 4478

ABN 27 003 546 423

21st January 2019

Ms. Catherine Colville
Woollahra Municipal Council

By email
cc. Mr. Chris Bluett

Dear Catherine

Re : *Four in Hand Hotel* – response from Ruth Daniell to the proposed listing
and inventory sheet

I refer to the letter to Council of 21st December 2018 from Ms. Ruth Daniell, engaged by the new owners of the *Four in Hand Hotel* to advise them. Thank you for the opportunity to reply to the comments Ms. Daniell makes, which I have kept in a concise form to maximise their utility at this point in time.

- We do not agree that the proposed listing of the *Four in Hand* has not been well planned. The listing investigation has proceeded in the context of a wider listing consideration of the group of hotels of concern to Council, and while the initial concern (to the community) over the *Four in Hand's* future has had a response in the owners' stated intentions to keep the Hotel trading, the listing process has started and proceeded both appropriately and professionally.
- The conclusions reached about the *Four In Hand* have been informed by the wider study.
There has been an opportunity for comparative analysis within the wider Study, and while that study is not yet finalised, a position is emerging in relation to the concept of a group listing of State Significance. The *Four in Hand* is not the only Hotel studied as asserted ; it was the first of the Hotels considered, because of its circumstances at commencement.
- There was no "supposition" in the listing sheet ; it reflects informed expert opinion at the time of its preparation.

- As we have concluded in the report, we do not consider the *Four in Hand* to be of State Significance. We note that it is Ms. Daniell's opinion that the *Four in Hand* would not be of State Significance.
- The level of significance, and attributed rarity of the Hotel, have been informed by the larger study of eleven pubs.

../2

2.

- We do not agree that it is acceptable for a conclusive fabric analysis of the *Four in Hand* to take place within a Heritage Impact Statement. Such statements are often assembled after a particular strategy has been devised for a building, and we firmly believe that what is necessary is a simple Conservation Management Document to properly analyse the current condition of the building, and establish guidelines for a responsible strategy to be prepared to address it. This must be a focused, concise document addressing the issues. Council has agreed that the historical research covered in the reports prepared for Council, including the *Four in Hand*, can be used in future conservation planning for the hotels. Council has also offered to offer advice in the process.
- At the site meeting facilitated by the new owners, at which you, Ms. Daniell and I were present, I do not recall agreeing that "there was little heritage fabric remaining in the interior". There is significant structural and spatial fabric, and while there has been extensive intervention, there are significant elements extant and it is to properly plan for the future evolution of the Hotel that a comprehensive consideration (in a CMD) must be made.
- The identification and assessment of significant building fabric is beyond the remit and capacity of a heritage inventory sheet. Our expert opinion of the Hotel's fabric formed within the Inventory Sheet's preparation has appropriately informed the conclusions and recommendations offered.
- There is no "confusion" as to the building as originally constructed and its current condition. Quite appropriately in conservation planning, questions can be asked about what further information might be helpful, if it exists, to assist the understanding of the building. If any of these observations were critical in the listing proceeding forward, they would have been appropriately investigated.

I hope these comments assist, and I am happy to discuss them further.

Yours sincerely



Robert Allan Moore